

31 July 2018

General Manager
City of Parramatta Council
PO Box 32
Parramatta NDW 2124

**ADVICE RELATING TO OVERSHADOWING ON COASTAL SALTMARSH
AND MANGROVE COMMUNITIES AT 85-91 THOMAS STREET,
PARRAMATTA**

Cumberland Ecology
PO Box 2474
Carlingford Court 2118
NSW Australia
Telephone (02) 9868 1933
Mobile 0425 333 466
Facsimile (02) 9868 1977
Web: www.cumberlandecology.com.au

In November my company, Cumberland Ecology prepared a report titled:

85-91 Thomas Street, Parramatta - Assessment of the Effects of Shading on Mangrove and Saltmarsh Vegetation Communities for Builtcom Constructions Pty Ltd.

The purpose of this letter to you is to summarise the implications of research results that were provided in that report to DPI Fisheries.

DPI Fisheries reviewed a development proposal for 85-91 Thomas Street, Parramatta (the subject site) and noted that the proposed height of the building was such that it could result in harmful shading of mangroves and saltmarsh communities located immediately to the south of the subject land, along the Parramatta River.

Cumberland Ecology staff consulted with DPI Fisheries to gain a clear understanding of the issue raised, and to agree upon a research project that could clarify the nature and extent of potential impacts (harm) that could be caused by shading if the proposal was approved and built.

Studies were made of the condition of mangroves and saltmarsh at a number of sites around Sydney, including along the Parramatta River to see if these communities could grow and survive within shaded sites that received at least as much shading as could be caused by the proposal. The research also factored in the seasonality of shading and daily duration of shading.

The research was successful in demonstrating that the proposal would have only minimal shading during a part of the year upon the nearby mangroves and saltmarsh communities along the Parramatta River. It also clearly showed that such communities could withstand a degree of shading without apparent significant impacts.

DPI Fisheries reviewed the report prepared by Cumberland Ecology and agreed with the findings made in relation to the two vegetation communities. DPI's comment (cced to Parramatta Council) on Wednesday, 13 December 2017 12:21 PM via email was:

DPI Fisheries has considered this report and does not see any reason for potential shading issues on mangrove and saltmarsh species to prevent the lodgement of this development, as currently proposed, as a planning proposal.

In conclusion, Cumberland Ecology and DPI Fisheries agree that the proposed development at 85-91 Thomas Street, Parramatta agree that no significant ecological impacts are likely as a result of the proposal upon mangroves and saltmarsh. There is therefore no ecological reason why the proposed development should not be approved.

The contact at DPI was Carla Ganassin and her email response is attached in Appendix A:

Carla Ganassin | Fisheries Manager | Aquatic Ecosystems Unit
NSW Department of Primary Industries | Fisheries NSW
Block E, Level 3, 84 Crown Street, Wollongong NSW 2500
T: 02 4222 8342 | F: 02 4225 9056 | E: carla.ganassin@dpi.nsw.gov.au
W: www.dpi.nsw.gov.au

In conclusion, we remain of the view that the proposed development will not have a significant impact upon either mangroves or saltmarsh and there is no reason the building height should be reduced. Should you wish for further clarification, please do not hesitate to contact me on 9868 1933.

Yours sincerely



Dr. David Robertson
Director
david.robertson@cumberlandecology.com.au
cc: gitanjali.katrak@cumberlandecology.com.au

Appendix A

85-91 Thomas Street, Parramatta - DPI
Email Response

Angela Mees

Subject: FW: FW: Thomas St - Final Report

From: Carla Ganassin [<mailto:carla.ganassin@dpi.nsw.gov.au>]
Sent: Wednesday, 13 December 2017 12:21 PM
To: Angela Mees; David Robertson
Cc: KKuo@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au
Subject: Re: FW: Thomas St - Final Report

Dear Angela,

Re: Advice relating to impact of overshadowing on saltmarsh and mangrove communities from a potential proposal to increase building height at [85-91 Thomas Street, Parramatta](#)

DPI Fisheries has received the following final report on the above matter via emailed download on 22 November 2017.

- '[85-91 Thomas Street, Parramatta](#) - Assessment of the Effects of Shading on Mangrove and Saltmarsh Vegetation Communities for Conquest Group of Companies' (Cumberland Ecology, November 2017)

DPI Fisheries has considered this report and does not see any reason for potential shading issues on mangrove and saltmarsh species to prevent the lodgement of this development, as currently proposed, as a planning proposal. It is noted that the November 2017 version of this document includes reference to the findings of the shading experiment on saltmarsh species contained within the Clark and Hannon paper.

Please note that DPI Fisheries consideration of this matter at this stage has strongly considered the:

- site specific saltmarsh and mangrove species composition and distribution, and
- site specific nature of the shading created by the proposed building which is relatively isolated from other nearby tall buildings.

In an email to Cumberland Ecology dated 9 November 2017, DPI Fisheries recommended that the seasonal shading example from Bobbin Head could be added to any information submitted with the planning proposal for this site. As it provides an example of shading of a comparable scale and seasonal nature to that likely to be created by this proposal. This example should demonstrate the following:

- the nature and extent of shading at the site (i.e. solid or dappled)
- the extent of shading, i.e. approximate area and any daily or seasonal changes to the shading
- the species compositions and condition of mangrove and saltmarsh habitat within the shaded area, and
- whether there is any difference in the species composition and condition within shaded areas compared to unshaded areas.

DPI Fisheries will provide the final (and next) comment on this matter once it is submitted as a planning proposal.

Regards,

Carla Ganassin | Fisheries Manager | Aquatic Ecosystems Unit
NSW Department of Primary Industries | Fisheries NSW
Block E, Level 3, 84 Crown Street, Wollongong NSW 2500
SEND MAIL TO: Locked Bag 1 | Nelson Bay NSW 2315
T: 02 4222 8342 | F: 02 4225 9056 | E: carla.ganassin@dpi.nsw.gov.au
W: www.dpi.nsw.gov.au

Conserve, Share, Provide

PERMIT APPLICATION FORMS & FISH HABITAT PROTECTION POLICIES AT:
www.dpi.nsw.gov.au/fisheries/habitat/protecting-habitats/toolkit
EMAIL COMPLETED APPLICATIONS TO: ahp.central@dpi.nsw.gov.au
APPLICATION PROCESSING TIMES (from date received): 28 days for Permits & Consultations; 40 days for IDA Referrals